



City of Kalamunda
Wattle Grove Cell 9 CCTV Feasibility Study
October 2020

Executive Summary

Mr Cameron Watts from Zenien (a highly experienced City Surveillance CCTV expert) was engaged by the City of Kalamunda to assess the feasibility of installing CCTV cameras in the following locations:

- a) Corner of Welshpool Rd East and Bruce Road Wattle Grove
- b) Corner of Welshpool Rd East and Hale Rd Wattle Grove
- c) Corner of Tonkin Hwy and Hale Rd Wattle Grove

These locations create effective pinch-points for vehicular traffic in and out of the Wattle Grove Cell 9 area, and the idea that capturing movements in these areas may reduce the actual or perceived crime in this area is considered a sound proposition.

We analysed a variety of factors relating to the feasibility of any CCTV deployment in these areas including:

- Existing Infrastructure (re-usable and that which creates a barrier/obstruction)
- Movement patterns (pedestrian, vehicles etc) at various times of the day/week.
- Crime heatmaps of the area
- Crime statistics (type of crime, trends and comparison to neighbouring areas)
- Proximity to City assets and Wireless communications potential (should the City desire a City wide CCTV network similar to other LGAs)
- Similar initiatives in related areas by other LGAs.
- Lighting levels and lighting challenges in each area
- Discussions with local Police (types of crime, common trends, specific concerns, usefulness of CCTV etc)
- Existing CCTV Solutions deployed by the City as well as the City of Kalamunda's CCTV Policy and Strategy
- Crime Prevention through environmental design (CPTED) alternatives to CCTV deployment

More detail of the actions undertaken and specific findings/recommendations are available in the full report. Some options for further consideration and discussion by Council, the Community Safety and Crime Prevention Committee and/or Public forums/groups are included in the summary table below:



Consideration	Recommendation	Comments
Usable Existing Mounting Infrastructure	Not considered Feasible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Poor potential for using existing mounting locations/poles Main Roads/Western Power poles (generally considered unusable) Few poles in locations ideal for CCTV (coverage/angles etc)
Availability of City Electricity Assets	Not considered Feasible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Few opportunities to gain fixed power assets, Solar a feasible option, however increased initial and ongoing costs may be cost-prohibitive.
Usefulness of traditional CCTV cameras (in these specific areas)	Poor / Not considered feasible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Insufficient value when addressing a cost-benefit analysis of standard/traditional CCTV Cameras Minimal return on significant investment, High ongoing maintenance costs, Limited potential for criminal evidence value, Higher City and Police resourcing costs to manage, obtain footage and check/maintain system. Vast majority of movement is vehicular
Option for the deployment of Automatic License plate recognition cameras	Feasible and recommended (budget and WAPOL endorsement permitting)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Requires WA Police endorsement High initial cost but potentially significant benefit Lower ongoing costs (compared to traditional CCTV) High Crime deterrent (especially with signage) Concept supported by Forresterfield Police
Option for Residential and Commercial Public-facing camera subsidies	Feasible – recommend for further discussion and consideration	Option to use grant funding or City budget to subsidise public-facing camera systems (must be registered with State CCTV Strategy) similar to the Town of Victoria Park Initiative.
CCTV Coverage at central retail area cameras at crime hotspot areas	Feasible but not recommended (insufficient community benefit)	This option is most logical when assessing the WA Police Crime heatmap. Will do little to protect residential areas. A solution similar to that of Kalamunda Rd High Wycombe (for example). Return on investment is unlikely to be sufficiently worthwhile especially given high ongoing maintenance costs.
Addition of Physical Security measures (fence off area)	Possibly Feasible (cost dependent) – requires community consultation & Police confirmation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consideration of fencing off access to the Cell 9 area from Tonkin Hwy for both Security and Noise control May reduce domestic break-ins and similar crime in some area Limited return on investment, however may increase Community Safety sentiment Supported by Crime heatmap assumptions



Recommendation - Summary

It is our recommendation that it is generally not feasible or directly beneficial to the community (given costs of deployment, ongoing maintenance and usefulness) to install CCTV in these areas. Supporting evidence does not align with traditional CCTV (in the areas analysed) being an effective solution or provide sufficient value for money.

The exception to this general recommendation is that if the following objectives can be achieved:

- WA Police agree that the locations are desirable for their ANPR mesh project and they are willing to receive data from ANPR cameras in these areas (noting that they are generally focused on major arterial roads not entrances to residential suburbs)
- Adequate grant funding could be achieved (estimated cost is \$120,000 ex GST combined)
- Community and Council support

An Automatic Number Plate Recognition system as part of the WA Police ANPR Mesh Project would provide greater benefits to the Community and Law enforcement as well as serving as a useful deterrent.

We have also discussed other options for consideration by the Community Safety and Crime Prevention Committee and/or Council that may be attractive alternatives. For instance the Public facing CCTV camera subsidisation project (similar to that of the Town of Victoria Park) may be desirable. Such an approach fosters community involvement and ownership of the CCTV/Security solution and does not require ongoing City funds for maintenance.

One of the other well received strategies was that of a Community Security Patrol Service and we encourage the City to investigate further into the costs, benefits and scope/limitations of such a service (more details on this are available in the main report). This aligns with the endorsed Community Safety and Crime Prevention Plan 2020 -2025 to investigate and report the possibility and financial impact of introducing a security patrol service.

The core outcome from this report is that while we are CCTV technology advocates and would normally encourage the adoption of City CCTV Surveillance initiatives, we believe that a traditional CCTV system deployment in these areas does not provide sufficient value for money to the City and the local Community in the area.

We welcome further discussions, community engagement, demonstrations etc as required should the City deem such to be beneficial.

Cameron Watts
Zenien
4/25 Tulloch Way
CANNING VALE WA 6155
Ph: (08) 6253 8999
Mobile: 0417 989 372
email: cameron@zenien.com.au
WA Police Licensed Security Agent/Consultant/Installer : SA34936
City of Kalamunda – Wattle Grove Cell 9 – CCTV Feasibility Study
Zenien - Oct 2020



City of Kalamunda – Wattle Grove Cell 9 – CCTV Feasibility Study
Zenien - Oct 2020